Board of Assessment Appeals Town of Oxford Regular Meeting

April 18, 2016

The meeting was called to order at 7:05 p.m.

Members Present: Linda Czaplinski, Ann Krane, Ed Carver

Amendments to Agenda:

None.

Approval of Minutes

MOTION:

Linda Czaplinski moved that the approval of minutes be tabled to Thursday, April 21, 2016, meeting. This was seconded by Ed Carver. All 3 Ayes. Motion carries.

Other items:

Linda stated that we are seeing more than usual appeals since it is a re-evaluation year.

Copies were distributed of the responses/backup from the Assessor to the questions asked. Linda received the information for the Appeal of Synas from his realtor. Information was received from the attorney for the Biondi appeal.

Ann Krane distributed her summary of the Laurel models at Oxford Greens for the appeals.

Linda received a return call from Mr. Crumley and he did want the Board to continue with his appeal without the additional work.

A Special Meeting was set for Wednesday, April 20, 2016, to discuss deliberations since the Board of Selectmen meeting was changed to Thursday, April 21, at 5 p.m. Everyone is available on Wednesday to meet. An agenda will be filed.

APPEALS:

Appeal of Barbara and Irwin Chinitz, 546 Caddie Court, Oxford

Discussion: A review of the Laurel models was held. Cost per square footage was discussed. Not all the models have the exact same footage. There was an actual physical measurement done in 2010 of all of the Oxford Greens and Meadowbrook condominiums. It was noted that Mr. Chinitz does have a Florida room. On the summary page, the Board took the sales for the homes in April 2015 and July 2015, and came to an average of \$164.5 per square foot for the average selling price. If we multiple the square footage of Mr. Chinitz home, the Board comes up with a \$426,000 appraised value. Mr. Chinitz model does have a walkout basement (unfinished), a deck, and a "good" rating for his kitchen. If we take the average sale price of \$426,000 and

compare with #618 that sold for \$432,000 with all of the add-ons, it will be a good representation for all of the comparables.

MOTION:

Ed Carver moved to change the valuation of the Appeal of Chinitz to \$429,000. This was seconded by Ann Krane. All 3 Ayes. Motion carries.

Appeal of Goldschmidt. 72-78 Larkey Road, Oxford

Discussion: This is the raw land that was 30 degree slope and it is not possible to have a driveway that steep. The town has a regulation of 14-1/2 degrees. Ed felt there is merit to his claim. Linda felt that maybe the Board could make a recommendation to contact the different town agencies to do an assessment and see if they can determine the quality of it and see if it is a buildable lot or not. The Goldschmidt's did not come with any documentation. If the parcel of land is not buildable, then they can go to the tax assessor. We can also make a recommendation to combine their two properties. Ed feels they would never give him access with a 30 degree elevation. Ed feels comfortable downgrading his price and recommending he goes back to Planning & Zoning and get some hard evidence for non-buildability, or combine this lot with the other property. The Goldschmidt's are only appealing the smaller parcel of 4.2 acres adjoining the 11 acres he owns. The price varies on the influence factor in terms of location; \$148,400 is a bit steep, with \$27,000 in excess acreage. A lengthy discussion was held. Ed Carver is willing to ask some of the agencies in town for some information before we can make a decision on this appeal.

MOTION:

Ed Carver moved to table the appeal of Goldschmidt until Thursday, April 21, 2016. This was seconded by Linda Czaplinski. All 3 Ayes. Motion tabled.

Appeal of James & Barbara Casagrande, Lot 45, Still Road (between 85 & 87 Still Road) Oxford

The Casagrande's are being taxed as a building lot, and the property is not buildable. It is 1 acre, has wetlands and ledge, and they are planning on adding it to their larger parcel. This parcel was in probate and was purchased for \$10,000.

MOTION:

Ed Carver moved to reduce the Casagrande assessment to \$10,000. This was seconded by Linda Czaplinski.

Discussion: Ed suggested putting this with a stipulation that they combine it by the next assessment period with their property. Linda did not know if we can make that stipulation.

MOTION:

Ed Carver moved to reduce the assessment of the piece of property for the Casagrande's, from Map 29/65/45 to \$10,000. This was seconded by Linda Czaplinski. All 3 Ayes. Motion carries.

Ed will get clarification regarding putting a stipulation on our motion.

Appeal Deliberations from April 11, 2016

Appeal of Charmane Howell-McCalla – 8 Butternut Ridge Road, Oxford

Ms. Howell-McCalla filed an appeal form and only wanted to see if her taxes were going up. The Board explained the process of how the mill rate is devised. Ed Carver will abstain from any vote since he was not here at the meeting during this appeal

MOTION:

Linda Czaplinski moved to deny the appeal of Charmane Howell-McCalla as the purpose of the appeal was simply to understand the process for establishing taxes due. This was seconded by Ann Krane. All 2 Ayes. 1 Abstention by Ed Carver since he was not present during this appeal. Motion carries.

Appeal of Janet Hertzmark, 146 Country Club Drive, Oxford

Mr. Hertzmark made a request that on his appeal form his request is to make it \$340,000. Ann Krane reviewed the comparables and she used some of Mr. Hertzmark's neighbors, but noted that some of the neighbors were Adler models. The square footage is also lower. Mr. Hertzmark's square footage equals to a \$173.7 per square foot cost according to his appraised value, and Mr. Hertzmark's is higher than his neighbors who are on the golf course. All of Ann's comparables are all on the golf course and one of the models is at \$172.8 per square foot; another \$185.8, & another \$177.5. The Assessor had given some comparables with some of the Redbridge models. #620 Troon sold, and went for \$409,000. There was a Putting Green model that sold this year for \$345,000. #349 Niblick is one of the comparables on Ann's sheet, and they closed on 4/29/16 at \$320,000 which is \$159.3/sq. foot. Regardless of the value now, all of the comparables are based at the time of the assessment. Mr. Hertzmark has a partially finished basement and a porch (a summer room with no heat). Mr. Hertzmark's home does have a deck. The Board reviewed all of the comparables. Mr. Hertzmark's home is appraised at \$253,100. All of our comparables are all lower, and the homes are on the golf course. Mr. Hertzmark does have a partial finished basement and an extra fixture in the bath. It was noted that the 5th fixture is standard for all Redbridge models. The OBSTR has to be a charge for the Golf Course. The Board questioned what the Golf Course view is worth. Ann also noted that you have to consider the area since some areas are two years newer. Ed compiled all of the comparables and the average assessed values for all of them come to \$251,000. Mr. Hertzmark is assessed at \$253,100. There have only been 1 or 2 sales that occurred in the comparables.

MOTION

Linda Czaplinski moved to deny the appeal of Mr. Hertzmark as the Board could find no discrepancy in the assessed value. Ed Carver seconded the motion.

Discussion: Ann would like to give Mr. Hertzmark a reduction of \$2,100 since his is not on the golf course. This is based on using all of the appraised numbers for the comparables that were presented.

MOTION:

Linda Czaplinski amended the motion to approve the appeal of Mr. Hertzmark with an adjusted assessed value to \$251,000. This was seconded by Ed Carver. All 3 Ayes. Motion carries.

Appeal of Hanrahan - The appellant decided not to come.

Appeal of Janet & Cynthia Peck - 548 Oxford Road, Oxford

MOTION:

Linda Czaplinski moved to deny the appeal of Janet & Cynthia Peck because the Board could not find any discrepancy in the assessed property. Ed Carver seconded the motion. All 3 Ayes. Motion carries.

Discussion: There was no supporting documentation for this appeal. The appellant felt the assessed value should be lower, and the assessed value did come down after their hearing with Vision from \$265,000 to \$257,500. Mr. Peck felt it should be \$250,000 but did not validate the information versus the last assessment.

Appeal of Brian Botti, 1C Autumn Ridge Road, Oxford

Discussion: The Board reviewed the response from the Assessor and the value did come down from the prior year. Mr. Botti is getting an influence factor of .5603 for the topography and is getting the C-factor of .5 as well. Mr. Botti is getting a lower I-factor than the other comparables in the area. The property has a slope of 12.5%. The comparables were reviewed. #309 Riggs went for \$100,000 and was 6.91 acres; #207 Riggs went for \$105,000; and 1A Autumn Ridge was sold for \$102,500. This is a very buildable lot and the Assessor did give him a lower allowance for the condition. A review and discussion was held. His assessment will remain at \$95,700, with an appraised value at \$136,700.

MOTION

Linda Czaplinski moved to deny the appeal of Brian Botti as the Board could find no discrepancy in the assessed value. This was seconded by Ed Carver. 2 Ayes, 1 opposed by Ann Krane. Motion carries.

Discussion: There was a discussion regarding the 6.9 acre lot selling for \$100,000, and the other comparable was a 2.2 acre lot for \$5000 more within one week of the sale. The comparables were reviewed and Comparable sale #3 (Vol/Pg 398/315) with the same map of the lots in the area has a different acreage than on the comparable sale #2 (Vol/Pg 398/457). Ann noted that the other lots on Riggs are flat and should have a higher factor.

MOTION

Ed Carver moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:40 p.m. This was seconded by Linda Czaplinski. All 3 Ayes. Motion carries.

Respectfully submitted,

Linda Czaplinski, Chairman Board of Assessment Appeals

Rinda Czapinski u

16 APR 27 AM 8:5
TOWN OF DAFFORD, C
TOWN OF DAFFORD, C
TOWN OLERN